



HEALTH CARE

IN ONTARIO

White Paper

A health care plan for Francophones people

SEPTEMBER 2018

The recommendations put forward by the AFO and Francophone stakeholders in the health care community are not made "merely" in a spirit of identity advocacy. More fundamentally, these requests are aimed at the direct impacts of "language barriers" and "minority status" on the overall performance of the health care system.



Table des matières

Executive summary	4
1. Recommendations regarding the gathering of evidence-based information;	6
2. Recommendations for improving access to French language health care services	6
3. Recommendations to broaden the pool of human resources that can provide French language health care services	7
Background	8
Situational analysis	9
Strategic Issues and Recommendations	15
1. Recommendations aimed at reinforcing the gathering of evidence-based information	16
2. Recommendations regarding access to French language health care services	17
3. Recommendations to broaden the pool of human resources that can provide French language health care services	18
Conclusion	20



Executive summary

In October, 2014, the first White Paper on French Language Health Care in Ontario was published under the direction of the Assemblée de la francophonie de l'Ontario (AFO). It targeted five strategic issues to improve the health care system and support the effective and efficient provision of quality French language health care services for all Ontarians.¹

This updated version of the White Paper asks the Government of Ontario and political and administrative decision-makers to renew their commitment to improve the performance of the health care system by offering French language health care services that are adapted to the needs of the people.

Just over three years after the publication of the first White Paper, access to quality, efficient and effective French language health care services remains a major issue. Progress has been made, but the gains are fragile. The Franco-Ontarian community remains hopeful that Ontario's new government will be a partner in efforts to improve French language health care services.

"A health care system that doesn't work for patients, seniors and families is a health care system that just isn't working at all.2" We agree with that statement.

Currently, there are designated regions where service providers offer very little or no French language services and there are Francophone communities that still cannot access care that they sorely need. This has consequences for patients and the system as whole, including misdiagnosis. late detection. underuse of human and financial resources and anxiety among patients – often the most vulnerable patients. The lack of French language services contributes to "hallway health care" and to poorer health for a portion of the population.



Furthermore, we note that considerable financial resources are invested year over year in various strategies, studies and initiatives that focus only on the Anglophone majority. These opportunities are not seized to gain a better understanding of Francophone communities and to study ways of adapting programs and services to meet their needs.

1. For further information, see White Paper on French Language Health Care in Ontario, Assemblée de la francophonie de l'Ontario, October, 2014.

2. For the People. A plan for Ontario, Ontario PC Party, May 2018.



A health system that takes into account the Francophone dimension when conducting research and implementing programs and services is a system that better respects the taxpayers' interest and the clients' dignity. Being "Francophone in a minority setting" is in itself a determinant of health outcomes that has a direct impact on the efficiency and efficacy of Ontario's health system.

Improving health services for Francophones involves access to priority care in their language, especially with regards to mental health, home care, primary care and telehealth services. The creation of the French Language Health Planning Entities ("the Entities") has helped to raise awareness of the importance of offering French language health care services within the system and improve planning in response to the needs of Francophones, but much more needs to be done.

The availability of **evidence-based information** to support decision-making is a key consideration for the efficient planning of access to services.

The reinforcement of **regulatory mechanisms** (legislation, regulations, accountability frameworks, etc.) is also advisable to ensure that a continuum of health care and services is available in all regions, both rural and urban. It should be kept in mind that, in contrast with the general population of the province, the majority of Franco-Ontarians live in rural areas.

Lastly, we suggest that innovative delivery models be explored to facilitate training, retention and integration of health care professionals who are fluent in the French language.

The 2014 White Paper on French Language Health Care in Ontario has been updated to reflect the evolution of the system over the years and the persistent issues facing the development and sustainability of Francophone health care services across the province.

Since the publication of this White Paper, the health system has undergone a reform and regulatory changes have ensued. A Guide to Requirements and Obligations Relating to French Language Health Services³ was published, specifying the roles that the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care (MHLTC), the Local Health Integration Networks (LHIN) and the French Language Planning Entities should play in the provision of French language health services. Indeed, the Franco-Ontarian community expressed praise for the collaboration displayed by the persons involved in designing the guide.

The three strategic issues put forward in this updated White Paper aim to support the Government of Ontario in:

- reinforcing the gathering of evidence-based information;
- improving access to French language health care; and
- broadening the pool of French language human resources.

^{3.} Guide to Requirements and Obligations Relating to French Language Health Services, November 2017.



1. Recommendations regarding the gathering of evidence-based information;

We suggest that the Government of Ontario should:

- 1.1 Systematically capture linguistic identity data for the entire population of Ontario through the Health Card.
- 1.2 Ensure the sustainability of systematic data collection on French language health care via the OZi portal and require the participation of all service providers under contract with the LHINs in order to assess their capacity to provide French language health care services; and
- 1.3 Require that the gathering of language data be consistent with the Inclusive Definition of Francophone adopted in 2009 and that all funded research include a representative sample of the Francophone minority to ensure that study results can be interpreted and applied to the Francophone population.

2. Recommendations for improving access to French language health care services

We suggest that the Government of Ontario should:

- 2.1 Support and fund the creation of innovative and integrated models of French language care, such as one-stop hubs and community health centres, as well as innovative models for service delivery, such as telehealth, to ensure a continuum of safe, quality care for Francophones and to reduce hallway congestion in hospitals;
- 2.2 Develop a strategy and an action plan for Francophones and provide the necessary funding for mental health, home care and primary services. These strategies should be adapted to local conditions by the LHINs in collaboration with the Entities;
- 2.3 Fund provincial support strategies for care pathways adapted to the needs of Francophones, such as navigators for French language health care services. These strategies should be adapted to local conditions by the LHINs in collaboration with the Entities; and
- 2.4 Have a plan for Francophones, including monitoring mechanisms for all strategies, policies, action plans and funding, as well as for all other regulations and transformations affecting the health care system.

We suggest that the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care should:

2.5 Implement the recommendations contained in the government's report Navigating the Journey to Wellness: The Comprehensive Mental Health and Addictions Action Plan for Ontarians, taking into account the Francophone perspective.



3. Recommendations to broaden the pool of human resources that can provide French language health care services

We suggest that the Government of Ontario should:

- 3.1 Define obligations relating to active offer for health care service providers and support requisite training on the topic of active offer for all personnel and students in the health care environment, e.g. the training designed by the Réseau du mieux-être francophone du nord de l'Ontario and supported by the Planning Entities; and
- 3.2 Fund innovative initiatives for accelerated health care training and/or upgrading, in particular for essential components of program promotion and recruitment by Ontario's Francophone and bilingual post-secondary institutions to address the lack of human resources in the field of French language health care services.





Background

In October, 2014, the first White Paper on French Language Health Care in Ontario was published under the direction of the Assemblée de la francophonie de l'Ontario (AFO). Its goal was to mobilize all partners in the health care sector around the following five strategic issues:

- Addressing the lack of sufficient evidence-based information to support informed decisionmaking at all levels;
- Increasing the involvement of Francophone stakeholders in public policy decision-making and reinforcing the accountability framework system-wide to give greater consideration to the Francophone dimension;
- Managing the transformation of the health care system and its tangible implications to consolidate and build on existing assets;
- Increasing the ability to seize opportunities created by health care system transformation;
 and
- Ensuring **adequate human resources**, both in terms of numbers and skills, to meet the needs of Ontario's Francophone community.

Since then, the health care system has undergone many transformations. Therefore, the White Paper now needs to be updated to identify the gains achieved, but also the gaps to be filled in the health care services provided to all Ontarians.

One of the key goals of this updating exercise is to obtain a renewed commitment from the Government of Ontario and its decision-makers. We hope that this commitment will result in the creation of favourable conditions for the effective and efficient delivery of quality services throughout the province, in both urban and rural areas.

Therefore, our analysis of the implementation of the 2014 recommendations is the starting point for a second round of reflection that aims to build upon past efforts.

The updated White Paper on French Language Health Care in Ontario is the latest step in a continuum that includes:

- the **process**, which successfully engaged and mobilized active agents of French language health care services in moving forward collectively to assess progress, identify ongoing challenges and reflect on priority actions to be continued;
- the intended purpose, which remains anchored in the Francophone community's desire to
 make a positive contribution to a system of efficient and effective quality health care and
 maximize the impact of public funds invested in the system; and
- the **premises**, which recognize and support a number of advances. However, it should be noted that many of the noted advances have yet to produce tangible impacts in the field. We hope that the Government of Ontario will be a constructive partner in the improvement of health care services for the province's Francophone population.



Situational analysis

Over the past three years, French language health care has continued to make progress in addressing the lack of services and improving the quality of care for all Ontarians.

Strategic thinking about French language health care services should encompass a wide range of considerations, such as local capacity, infrastructure, human resources (recruitment, training and retention), allocation of funding and the degree of awareness and understanding among decision-makers regarding the many challenges that are inherent to a minority setting.

In this view, let us examine the current situation on the basis of the five strategic issues identified in 2014.

Progress on the issues and recommendations identified in 2014		
2014 Recommendations	Progress observed	
Evidence-based information		
Systematically capture the linguistic identity of Ontarians through the Health Card.	Integration of linguistic identity in the Health Card was adopted in the 2018-2019 provincial budget, but has not yet been implemented.	
Systematically include the capacity to offer French language services in provincial professional licensing body directories and regularly update linguistic ability profiles within them	No tangible progress has been noted in this area.	
Systematically embed the linguistic dimension in health research while increasing the usage and sharing of field studies to better influence the provincial, regional and local decision-making process, and to strengthen partnerships with provincial academic institutions in this respect.	No tangible progress has been noted in this area.	



The Francophone lens

- Systematize the assessment of impacts on Francophones -and therefore on the offer of French language services -for all policies, programs or initiatives developed by the MOHLTC and other relevant ministries at the policy development stage.
- No tangible progress has been noted in this area.
- Set up graduated accountability at all levels, including reviewing/ clarifying the roles and responsibilities of various organizations and institutions involved in the system, strengthen the framework of legal/contractual agreements between these stakeholders, and consolidate monitoring/control, assessment and incentive/ sanction mechanisms.
- A position of Associate Deputy Minister, Health System Performance Accountability, and French Language Services was created, thus providing accountability for the performance of the health care system and French language services.
- A directive issued by the MHLTC has increased Francophone representation on LHIN boards, but implementation is lagging in some regions.
- The MHLTC published a Guide to Requirements and Obligations Relating to French Language Health Services.

Transforming the health care system

- Maintain French language services planning capability across the province and extend the mandate of the Planning Entities.
- The mandate of the Entities was renewed.
- Amendments Regulation to 515/09 have made it possible to begin a process to clarify the role of the Entities, though the Entities' budget has not been adjusted since their implementation.



- Take Francophone needs and the existing capacity to provide French language services into consideration; identify Francophone pillars (designated organizations) during the integration strategy and consolidate their role in the provision of French language services
- The creation of planning subregions within the LHINs has increased the capacity to plan health care services that are better adapted to community needs. That being said, there are still concerns that this new segmentation might dilute the Francophone presence and thus hinder the development of French language health care services.
- Ensure, through the establishment of legal and/ or contractual agreements, that stakeholders subject to French language service requirements do not shrug off their responsibilities in this regard through outsourcing initiatives and that private sector providers uphold the same obligations.
- Designated and/or identified service providers are now required to develop a French language services plan, with support from the LHINs and the Entities. This is a first step to induce them to take the Francophone component into account when planning their services.

Seizing opportunities

- Increase Francophone access to primary and community care province-wide, in the spirit of the shift initiated by the MOHLTC, to solidify primary care.
- A recent reform of the health care system included a focus on equity and improving cultural and linguistic awareness, as well as the delivery of health care services to Francophones.
- The MHLTC's 2017 action plan Aging with Confidence: Ontario's Action Plan for Seniors aims to add 5000 long-term care beds by 2022 and expects 500 spots to be attributed to Francophone seniors.



- Insist on the obligation to address Francophone population needs in all health links.
- The creation of sub-regions within the LHINs as part of the latest reform of the health care system aims to ensure that planning is based on mechanisms that take into account geographical, human and demographic needs, including those of Francophones.
- Strengthen the continuum of mental care services in French, in accordance with the 10-year plan.
- No tangible progress has been noted in this area.

Ensuring adequate human resources

- Develop an integrated human resources plan for the health care sector using evidence-based information on needs, supply and available skills.
- Hôpital Montfort was designated as an Academic Health Sciences Centre with a mandate to participate in planning and supporting French language health care in communities throughout Ontario, including clinical support to patients and professionals. Montfort has yet to receive the funding needed to implement the action plan developed at the Summit on the Future of French Language Human Resources in Healthcare in Ontario and thus fulfill its new mandate.
- The OZi portal was created and deployed province-wide. This tool provides an environmental analysis of the capacity to provide French language health care services among suppliers of health care services funded by the LHINs - an initiative of the Réseau des services de santé en français de l'Est de l'Ontario, funded by the MHLTC.



Increase opportunities for Francophone professional development by supporting existing infrastructure and increasing the number of professional health education programs offered in French by various Francophone and bilingual higher education institutions across the province (at the college and university levels)	No tangible progress has been noted in this area.
Promote bilingual human resources development in practical terms, and encourage self-identification	 Several initiatives are underway, but their results are still fragmentary.
Support integration, and even acceleration, of the foreign credential recognition process for new immigrants, particularly Francophone newcomers.	No tangible progress has been noted in this area.
Promote the concept of active offer, to be applied in all designated or identified centres.	A Joint Position Statement on the Active Offer of French Language Health Services in Ontario was produced and widely promoted by the Regroupement des Entités de planification des services en français and the Alliance des Réseaux ontariens de santé en français. It was echoed by the Office of the French Language Services Commissioner of Ontario in the Special Report – Active Offer of Services in French: The Cornerstone for Achieving the Objectives of Ontario's French Language Services Act. The MHLTC included the content of the statement in the mandate letters of LHINs with health care service providers.

Regarding evidence-based information, it is advisable to continue to work on developing mechanisms and tools to provide quick access to the information needed to support the planning of efficient and effective quality health care services in all regions of Ontario and to support the government's efforts to eliminate "hallway health care."



Furthermore, we suggest that a solid Francophone presence be maintained in the decision-making bodies to provide monitoring and to ensure that decisions do not neglect the Francophone perspective, as indicated by the absence of French language services in many designated regions of the province. Modernization of the French Language Services Act should be supported as an opportunity to reinforce the accountability of decision-makers and suppliers in the area of health care services.

It is also advisable that obligations regarding active offer be kept on the radar of key players in the health care field. This important issue was also raised by Ontario's Commissioner of French Language Services in the Special Report – Active Offer of Services in French: The Cornerstone for Achieving the Objectives of Ontario's French Language Services Act. In particular, the report calls attention to the lack of active offer of health care services to the Francophone population and urges the Government of Ontario to remedy the problem by adopting concrete measures and providing the necessary tools so that ministries, agencies and third-party providers of services on behalf of the government ensure the active offer of French language services⁴. This White Paper supports the commissioner's recommendations.

Active offer of French language health care services and the obligations of third-party health care providers are topical issues in the Francophone community. At its annual general meeting in Ottawa in October, 2017, AFO members voted unanimously in favour of five priorities for an eventual modernization of the French Language Services Act. The resolution recommends that the Government of Ontario include the concept of active offer in the French Language Services Act, clearly state that the Act applies to health care services mandated by the LHINs, and include within the Act the totality of Regulation 284/11 Provision of French Language Health Services on Behalf of Governmental Agencies.

^{4.} Special Report – Active Offer of Services in French: The Cornerstone for Achieving the Objectives of Ontario's French Language Services Act. Summary, Office of the French Language Services Commissioner, 2016.





Strategic Issues and Recommendations

French language health care services require a comprehensive vision that fosters innovation, flexibility and multi-stakeholder dialogue to devise durable and beneficial solutions for Ontario.

The goal of the Franco-Ontarian community and its leaders is always to work in partnership with the Government of Ontario and health care professionals across the province to improve quality of care and optimize the health care system's general performance. In that respect, the provision of French language health care services has a positive influence on the quality and safety of care, which in turn allows the system to achieve gains in efficiency and efficacy. That is why it is important to focus on developing the provision of French language health care services as the end result, especially in designated regions.

Though some progress has been made in recent years, communities needing access to French language health care services continue to wait for results on the ground. Ontario's Francophone communities have been left wanting and are scrutinizing implementation strategies in the following areas:

- the recent reform of the health care system and the measures to be taken to truly achieve equal access and quality of care for Francophones;
- the MHLTC's 2017 action plan Aging with Confidence: Ontario's Action Plan for Seniors, which aims to add 5000 long-term care beds by 2022, of which 10% (500 beds) are slated for Francophone seniors. The community is pleased with the added beds confirmed for some regions and hopes that beds will be found for Francophones in every region of Ontario. Moreover, in the last electoral campaign, the Government of Ontario promised to add 15,000 long-term care beds in the next five years and 30,000 beds in the next ten years; and
- the Comprehensive Mental Health and Addictions action plan and the Ontario government's commitment to increase funding for mental health by \$1.9 billion over ten years. The community is waiting to hear details about actions aimed specifically at Francophones. Further, we welcome the restructuring which has allowed the MHLTC to reassume responsibility for child and youth mental health services.

These background elements were brought to bear on the thinking that led to renewing or adding recommendations to ensure that Francophones in all regions, urban and rural, eastern, northern or central-southwestern, can access health care services provided in their language and appropriate to their needs.



The three strategic issues put forward in this updated White Paper aim to support the Government of Ontario's efforts to:

- reinforce the gathering of evidence-based information;
- improve access to health care services in French; and
- broaden the **pool of human resources** for French language health care services.

For each of these vectors, a series of targeted, tangible and achievable measures is proposed.

1. Recommendations aimed at reinforcing the gathering of evidence-based information

Francophone health care professionals face structural barriers that significantly limit their ability to gather rigorous evidence-based information. It is impossible to manage a quality health care system efficiently and effectively without evidence-based information. With the necessary evidence in hand, the system can better respect the taxpayer by maximizing the potential of invested human and fiscal resources and the quality of care.

We hope that the Government of Ontario will continue the work already begun to capture the linguistic identity of both users and professionals and that this work will be completed in a very near future. It is surprising to see that, even today, the regulatory agencies that define the quality standards for health care provided in provincial institutions can exclude the language variable from their analyses, despite the fact that provincial legislation formally recognizes the importance of linguistically adapted care.

We are hopeful that current efforts will be furthered to persuade these agencies to take the language variable into consideration as a determinant of the quality of care and a factor for the safety and efficiency of services and human resources.

1. Recommendations regarding evidence gathering

We suggest that the Government of Ontario should:

- 1.1 Systematically capture linquistic identity data for the entire population of Ontario through the Health Card:
- 1.2 Ensure the sustainability of systematic data collection on French language health care via the OZi portal and require the participation of all service providers under contract with the LHINs in order to assess their capacity to provide French language health care services; and
- 1.3 Require that the gathering of language data be consistent with the Inclusive Definition of Francophone adopted in 2009 and that all funded research include a representative sample of the Francophone minority to ensure that study results can be interpreted and applied to the Francophone population.



2. Recommendations regarding access to French language health care services

Access to health care services remains an issue throughout the province. We believe that the concept of active offer of French language services needs to be reinforced, as recommended by the Commissioner of French Language Services, and that strategies aimed specifically at Francophones need to be developed in the earliest planning stages of all policies or programs. In a quality, efficient and effective health care system, the offer and accessibility of French language health care in Ontario cannot be seen as a marginal or separate problem superimposed on the general health system.

Improving the accessibility of French language health care services involves reinforcing the obligations of service providers regarding active offer, through the development of a navigation service for Francophone health care, as well as the development of a specific strategy for Francophones to remedy the ongoing lack of French language health care services, especially for primary care, home care and mental health.

We note that many Francophone communities in designated regions with a large population of seniors still cannot access Francophone or bilingual long-term care facilities locally. This problem is especially obvious rural communities, where the majority of Francophones reside, and it varies greatly from city to city. Measures need to be designed to facilitate the expansion of local capacities.

Francophones require a planning approach that is adapted to their needs. Ontario will never have a health system that truly offers quality, efficient and effective services and that does not fail patients, families and seniors if real needs of a significant portion of its population are not understood or considered in the general offer of services.



2. Recommendations regarding access to French language health care services

We suggest that the Government of Ontario should:

- 2.1 Support and fund the creation of innovative and integrated models of French language care, such as one-stop hubs and community health centres, as well as innovative models for service delivery, such as telehealth, to ensure a continuum of safe, quality care for Francophones and reduce hallway congestion in hospitals;
- 2.2 Develop a strategy and an action plan for Francophones and provide the necessary funding for mental health, home care and primary services. These strategies should be adapted to local conditions by the LHINs in collaboration with the Entities;
- 2.3 Fund provincial support strategies for care pathways adapted to the needs of Francophones, such as navigators for French language health care services. These strategies should be adapted to local conditions by the LHINs in collaboration with the Entities; and
- 2.4 Have a plan for Francophones, including monitoring mechanisms for all strategies, policies, action plans and funding, and for all other regulations and transformations affecting the health care system.

We suggest that the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care should:

- 2.5 Merge all French language mental health and addictions programs and services, as recommended in the report Navigating the Journey to Wellness: The Comprehensive Mental Health and Addictions Action Plan for Ontarians; and
- 2.6 Move quickly to implement a provincial plan for Francophones targeting addiction to prescription analgesics.

3. Recommendations to broaden the pool of human resources that can provide French language health care services

Improving the delivery of French language health care services in Ontario is closely linked to the quality and availability of human resources that services providers can draw on to fulfill their mission. Many factors help to maintain the pool of human resources for French language health care services, including Francophone immigration (see the White Paper on Francophone Immigration in Ontario), educational institutions and mechanisms to raise awareness about the active offer of French language services.

Access to French language training programs is a key factor in broadening the pool of qualified workers who can provide French language health care services. Therefore, we support the creation of French language training programs for the health care sector. Facilitating access across the province should also be an objective. Statistics show that a majority of graduates choose to



settle in the region where they received their education. This indicates the importance of having strategic training centres in the four corners of the province to meet the need for human resources by facilitating the recruitment and retention of staff. At the very least, health sciences curricula should be expected to include a component that informs students of the challenges faced by Francophone communities and the importance of the active offer principle.

Immigration is another way in which the Government of Ontario can partly fulfill the demand for French-speaking health care professionals. That topic is not discussed here, because potential solutions have been presented in the White Paper on Francophone Immigration in Ontario⁵, in particular measures 9 and 10.

3. Recommendations to broaden the pool of human resources that can provide French language health care services

We suggest that the Government of Ontario should:

- 3.1 Define obligations relating to active offer for health care service providers and support requisite training on the topic of active offer for all personnel and students in the health care environment, e.g. the training designed by the *Réseau du mieux-être francophone du Nord de l'Ontario* and supported by the Planning Entities; and
- 3.2 Fund innovative initiatives for accelerated health care training and/or upgrading, in particular for essential components of program promotion and recruitment by Francophone and bilingual post-secondary institutions to address the lack of human resources in the field of French language health care services.

5. Francophone Immigration in Ontario. White Paper. March 2017, Assemblée de la francophonie de l'Ontario.





Conclusion

This updated version of the White Paper asks the Government of Ontario and political and administrative decision-makers to renew their commitment to **improving the performance of the health care system** by offering French language health care services that are **adapted to the needs of the people**. Commitment means putting concrete measures in place to achieve the desired results, namely observable and measurable change that ensures access to linguistically adapted health care services for Francophones in Ontario.

We hope that the Government of Ontario will be the people's partner in health care, particularly with regards to:

- gathering evidence-based information to support good decision-making and to develop
 a province-wide base of rigorous knowledge about the needs of Francophones and their
 utilization of health care services, the capacity to provide French language services, the
 availability of bilingual professionals and the quality of care provided.
- **improving access to French language health care services**, which involves reinforcing the surveillance measures for service suppliers in designated regions, adding a navigation service specifically for Francophone users and their families, and elaborating strategies and a provincial action plan specifically for Francophones with urgent needs, particularly in mental health, long-term care, primary care and telehealth; and
- broadening the pool of human resources for French language services as an essential element
 of consistency between desired results and the means to achieve them. Ensuring adequate
 human resources inevitably involves facilitating entry into the profession for Francophone
 immigrants who have the appropriate medical training, as well as requiring training on the
 active offer of French language health care to all stakeholders in the health care sector.









L'ASSEMBLÉE DE LA FRANCOPHONIE DE L'ONTARIO

613-744-6649 / Sans frais 1-866-596-4692 / Télec: (613) 744-8861 435 rue Donald, bureau 336, Ottawa (Ontario) K1K 4X5